

# STATES OF JERSEY

## SCRUTINY COMMITTEE BLAMPIED ROOM, STATES BUILDING

### WASTE MANAGEMENT STRATEGY

-----

**Present:**            **Deputy Phil Rondel (Review Chairman)**  
                         **Senator Ted Vibert**  
                         **Senator Jean Le Maistre**  
                         **Deputy Rob Duhamel**  
                         **Deputy Bob Hill**

-----

**PRESENTATION BY AND QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS TO  
MR FRANCOIS MARTIN and CLAUDE LETELLER (SPEN)  
and  
MR CHRISTIAN PINEL (SIREC)**

-----

on

**Thursday, 17th February 2005**

-----

(Digital Transcription by Marten Walsh Cherer Limited,  
Midway House, 27/29 Cursitor St., London, EC4A 1LT.  
Telephone: 020 7405 5010. Fax: 020 7405 5026)

-----

DEPUTY RONDEL: I have to read this in English prior to your starting. It is important that you fully understand the conditions under which you are appearing at this hearing. You will find a printed copy of the statement that I am about to read to you on the table in front of you.

Shadow Scrutiny Panels have been established by the States to create opportunities for training States Members and Officers in developing new skills in advance of the proposed changes of government. During this shadow period, the Panel has no statutory powers and the proceedings at public hearings are not covered by Parliamentary privilege. This means that anyone participating, whether a Panel Member or a person giving evidence, is not protected from being sued or prosecuted for anything said during hearings. The Panel would like you to bear this in mind when answering questions and to ensure that you understand that you are fully responsible for any comments that you make. Gentlemen, could you please give your names so that it is recorded?

### **Mr Pinel, Mr Martin Mr Leteller introduced themselves**

DEPUTY RONDEL: You are now going to give us a presentation. Who will start? I presume it will be Mr Pinel.

### **Mr Pinel began to deliver his presentation in French**

DEPUTY RONDEL: Gentlemen, are you quite happy to continue the presentation in French by the gentlemen concerned, or would you like a translation as we go along?

SENATOR VIBERT: I am having difficulty, I have to say. I think if we could get a summary.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Even a summary would be helpful.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes. The introduction was basically that the gentleman was just explaining that it is several small companies working together. They are working together because they have expertise in different areas and, between them, can offer Jersey a complete project which would take waste from collection to disposal.

### **The presentation continued with a Scrutiny Officer translating, where necessary, as the presentation was delivered in French**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: What they have done is they have put together the key points that they think we need to know and, from that, they hope we can have discussion on any queries,

and they are happy to answer any questions on anything you may have. They have slight technical problem, in that they cannot make it any larger than it is.

DEPUTY RONDEL: That is fine.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Is that all right?

DEPUTY RONDEL: Yes.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They are going to give you the context of the project they are proposing. They are going to give you a summary of the expertise of the companies involved and where each company is going to take responsibility. They are going to give you an overall picture of the project. They are going to explain the logistics of exporting and moving. They are going to discuss the cost implications of the project and all the political and environmental issues that will arise from such activity. They are going to explain the initial stages of the project and how they would commence and conclude.

### **The presentation continued**

DEPUTY RONDEL: So a general discussion.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: It is the understanding of the proposal that Jersey has an incinerator which has reached the end of its life and we are in the position of looking at the possibility of replacing or taking other action.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: It is the understanding of the companies that Jersey currently isn't really getting the maximum from its recycling. The recycling that is currently undertaken seems to be sporadic. It is not as intense as it could be and a lot of products are being put into the waste stream that could result in achieving revenue from being recycled.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: There is a problem with stockpiling of waste that is going for incineration. The problem is that the stocking areas that we have are not really used properly or are sufficient for our needs.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: So the project is looking for a durable and longer term solution for the Island and it has taken into consideration all the environmental and economic aspects of the proposal.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: This proposal is as a result of the visits that people from Jersey have had, people coming over to the plants. Through all the discussions, the group of companies believe that they have enough expertise between them to provide us a solution from collection to final disposal of the waste.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: The gentleman is just explaining the technicalities of waste really. He is explaining that there are many different waste streams that have to be treated in different ways, such as agricultural, industrial, commercial waste and household waste and he was explaining that Sirec deals with the industrial waste type of things and Spen deals with the collection and household waste side of things, so that both companies compliment each other.

DEPUTY HILL: Could you just ask about clinical, medical and animal waste?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (following translation): They themselves don't deal with animal or clinical waste because it is very specialised and it needs certain authorities, but they do have partners that deal with those specific waste streams.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Panel Members, if you want to put questions as we go through, it is probably easier.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Well done, Bob. Thank you.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (following translation): They are more than happy to answer anything.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: What they are explaining is that they can help Jersey to plan a collecting system and show them how to implement it, both from door to door collection, but

also setting up selection points and collection points for all the various recyclables.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And even in the door to door collection, they encourage group collections and they have 12 years of experience in this type of group collection and find that it does work very well to encourage that kind of group collection even in households.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: So the importance is to recognise the different needs of waste collection for all the different streams of waste really, and they deal with all of the different streams, industrial, commercial and household.

### **The presentation continued**

DEPUTY RONDEL (asks question in French).

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He is saying they are happy to either ----

SENATOR VIBERT: Could you interpret the question as well, please?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, sorry. The question was could Sirec and Spen accommodate contractors that were already employed by the Parishes, and the response was that, yes, they can come into the chain of activity at any point. They already work with contractors in France in some areas. In other areas, they do collections from start to the end of disposal, but they can come in at any point in the chain in any area that is required.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: It is essential that there would have to be an initial sort of the rubbish, so there would have to be a collection point because, under the French legislation, they are not allowed to dispose of any refuse that is recyclable, so all your key and valuable recycles must be taken out of any rubbish prior to disposal.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Again, there are very many methods of doing the sorting. This can be sorted at source, which obviously is to be encouraged, or this can be sorted at the sorting centres and refined, so they are capable of taking a variety of different types of waste and achieving the sorting at different stages.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: What they have achieved very well as a group is getting money back for the recyclable material. They have now very good people that take the recyclable materials from them and they can make money from the recyclables.

DEPUTY RONDEL (following translation): The question was what percentage of the material stays in France, and the answer was about 80% and the rests goes outside.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: In Europe, about 80% in Europe.

DEPUTY RONDEL: In Europe, sorry, yes.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: And about 20% goes elsewhere.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, they have some very important outlets in Europe for recyclable materials. The rules are very strict on the quality of recyclables, but they also get a very good price back on their recyclables because of that policy.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He is saying that the proposal would be that any waste that is not recyclable, the inert waste that is left, goes to landfill.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: What they do with toxic waste -- paint pots and all that kind of thing and neon products -- is they would be stocked and then sent to a specialist company to dispose of.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Any questions, no? Continue, please.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He has just explained the rôle of the group as they see it, and what they are saying is they can either implement a whole system for Jersey or they can act as a consultant and advise and give you a plan basically, so it is very flexible, the way in which the group of companies could work for Jersey.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They have done a lot of studying about some of the options which

would be suitable.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They could offer a complete solution.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: This could be the establishment of how the waste would be collected or in establishing waste sorting centres through the Island.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And it is their livelihood to offer the collection and the resale of recyclable products.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They have significant experience in working with small collection agencies in France and are used to gearing to European rules and regulations.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They are also used to working with service industries, industrial and commercial operators.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They have their own equipment that they use and they can facilitate the use of that equipment via the companies or adapt as needed.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And they have developed specific collection centres and vehicles for collecting the waste. It is very specific so that it deals with recycling.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They have also got a lot of crushing mechanical ----

DEPUTY RONDEL: Crushing plants.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, crushing plants, so that you can maximise the storage facilities and minimise the amount of space required.

**The presentation continued**

DEPUTY RONDEL (following translation): It is seven foot three over here.

SENATOR VIBERT: Again, Carol, can you translate that, please?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes. The question was, have the companies taken into account the smaller vehicles required for Jersey roads and the gentleman answered that they already have a smaller vehicle. They have a 2.55 and a 2.3 metre, so they do need smaller vehicles for certain areas in France also.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes. The gentleman saw some lorries coming down from the airport with rubble or something on them and he said that they do have a collection of lorries that are the same, the same style.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They do also deal with green waste. They do already produce compost material from green waste.

DEPUTY RONDEL: The green waste, I want to know if it is windrow or if it is in-vessel composting.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: The treatment process.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Yes, the treatment.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (following translation): They do it in an open style, but with controlled ventilation.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They use a drain underneath the composting to avoid having to turn it. That oxygenates it underneath through the drainage system rather than have to turn it, which results in odours.

DEPUTY RONDEL: I see.

SENATOR VIBERT: Could I ask a question?

DEPUTY RONDEL: Yes, sorry, carry on.

SENATOR VIBERT: How long would it take your group to analyse Jersey's collection system and what information would they require to make a decision about how much it would cost?

(SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR translated) Yes, to work out the financial cost. (SCRUTINY



TRANSLATOR translated) Carol, could I add that we have the statistics from each of the parishes, so we know how many households there are and we know how much waste they produce.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (following translation): In order to really examine the whole thing properly and to give a proper, realistic evaluation they would need two and a half to three months to work it out.

SENATOR VIBERT: Could I also ask whether they would employ some of the people who are currently doing it, and would they be prepared to train and take on existing people?

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: That is a separate question, in fairness. The study is one thing, but the implementation, they said earlier they would either work with the existing people or they could provide a total solution from beginning to end.

SENATOR VIBERT: Right, okay, fine.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Please continue.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He is saying that, at the waste collection sites, they look at what they call the ultimate waste, which is what really can't be recycled and the aim is to keep reducing that and to meet all the EU requirements to minimise that ultimate waste.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And their approach to the treatment of the ultimate waste is the most environmentally -- in their opinion the most environmentally -- sound solution for the treatment of that waste.

SENATOR VIBERT: What do they do with it?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (following translation): And that is to landfill.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Regulation surrounding this activity is stable.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And this is a specialised profession now really in the dealing with the landfill sites in order to ensure that there is a minimal impact on the environment.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And it really has become a profession now, and you do have to employ very qualified people to ensure.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: It is highly regulated by external regulators and they have to adhere to stringent laws and regulations.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: This is also a solution that is now accepted by the public in France as long as all the conditions and criteria of the regulations are met at the sites.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: What they find is that the populations around incinerators are more fearful of incinerators, due to dioxins and emissions, than people around landfill sites.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, the rural areas prefer the technical solution of using landfill sites due to the cost implications as well as other issues.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: So paper, cardboard, plastic and metal are recycled and cables and they deal with electrical equipment -- computers and all that kind of thing and mobile phones.

SENATOR VIBERT: Batteries?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And also cars.

SENATOR VIBERT: Rubber tyres?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, and scrap metal. They deal with all those things on a recyclable basis.

SENATOR VIBERT: We have some photographs.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, they also deal with wood and green waste.

SENATOR VIBERT: On wood, is that painted wood?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (following translation): Yes, either painted or treated.

DEPUTY RONDEL: (asks question in French) Oh okay.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He said painted wood can't be recycled and that goes for disposal.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He said the two groups feel that they can bring together a lot of experience in all the different areas and they are both looking to expand their businesses and they feel that the possibility of Jersey is an opportunity that they would be very much interested in exploring further.

DEPUTY RONDEL (following translation): The question was if there were any trans-boundary problems, and the answer was that they have spoken with Senator Le Grand, who is putting all his power behind it to make things happen so that an agreement could be reached between Jersey and France.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He has confirmed that within the regulations there is the possibility of trans-boundary transportation of waste.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They do have regional authority or permission from the local authorities to undertake all of their activities. They don't undertake any activities at all in their businesses without having achieved all the local, regional or whatever authorities that they require.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: This is a guarantee that they give all their clients, that they will work within the boundaries of any rules and regulations of the country, the region or the area within which they are working.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They have permissions to work for the next 28 years, so they have longevity.

DEPUTY RONDEL: (asks a question in French)

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: The working hours in France are standard at 35 hours a week. We have explained that Jersey has slightly different working hours, which sometimes can be 40 hours a week.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: This may be one of the reasons that sorting recyclable materials may be better placed to be done in Jersey, due to the different working hours.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They also have certification for the quality of their environmental activities, ISA Standard 9001 and ISO 14000.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, these are environmental standards that are internationally recognised.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They are bringing experience and competence as part of an association to deal with the global problem of waste for Jersey.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: With regard to logistics, one of the key things that should be noted is that we are only 25km away from the La Manche area, so it is a very good situation.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And we are also in the very fortunate position of having two commercial ports in France -- Cherbourg and Granville -- which could service any transport.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And also another advantage is the proximity of the treatment plants that they have in France, with Cherbourg only 30km away and they have a plant at Granville, they have got one at 45km and another at 40km, so ----

SENATOR VIBERT: Is that incinerator plants?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: No, they are not incinerator plants, they are waste recyclable treatment plants and landfill.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Those are the ones we visited on our previous trip.

SENATOR VIBERT: Yes.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, their two recycling sites are at Isigny Le Baut, which Members will have seen when they visited France, and Ternier (sic) and Aram (sic) is the centre for the sorting of the waste.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: The benefit of using a company or companies that already have treatment sites and sorting sites and recyclable waste streams set up to sell on is that you get economies of scale and everything is already set up, so there is the potential for significant savings for Jersey and also benefits for the handling agents.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And it is also very easy, given the location and proximity, for people to be trained in Jersey to do the necessary. The companies and plants are so close it is very easy for them to train people in Jersey and, therefore, to achieve further training savings.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Through discussions with political people in France, the companies have found that there is a great will to increase the activities at all levels with Jersey, and that includes the treatment of waste for Jersey. There is a significant will to achieve this.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Okay, what is key to the project, and in order for it to be able to move forward in more detail, is that they need to have full information on categories of waste that we have and the respective tonnage. They would also need the actual collection method for all of these wastes in detail and their current disposal method in order that they can ... and the value of the waste.

**The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And what the syndicate recognises is that Jersey does do some waste recycling very well, and what it would like to do is study that further, the things that we

actually do, and encourage and continue what is done very well, but to look for a solution that covers the areas that aren't addressed or aren't done particularly viably at the present time. It wouldn't be seeking to impose a global solution without looking at what is already done well and encouraging that continuation, but just to fill in all the gaps really.

SENATOR VIBERT: I am not sure where they have got the idea that we do recycling here very well. Can you put the question?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (following translation): Currently, the gentleman says that he hasn't actually seen any recycling, but he is open minded in assuming that we do some recycling.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, he is sure that Jersey has got some good things in place.

SENATOR VIBERT: Very different though.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (following translation): He is impressed because he has actually seen the bins in the kitchen -- one for glass and one for other rubbish -- so we makings effort.

SENATOR VIBERT: If you go to Rob's house and you will see five bins.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: What they need to have now is more information really, more statistics, so that they can do a study and come back with a solution that will meet our needs. At that point, they can give figures that would go with providing those services.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And once you have those figures, it would be at that point that Jersey could look at the proposals and decide whether it would fit in with its strategic aims and fit in with the requirements that Jersey will have.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: The syndicate really feels that this time really does give us an opportunity, a real opportunity, to improve the way that Jersey treats the whole of its waste streams, and part of that is the benefit of our geographical location with the sites on offer, the potential for rationalising the costs due to all the sites being already being set up in France and also the wealth of experience that these companies would bring.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And it is an opportunity that is presenting itself to develop further the links that we already have with La Manche and also the general feeling that there is a very strong will for further relations and much more close working relations with that area.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, so it is now to progress the project. If it were to progress, it would be to do a very detailed study on the requirements that Jersey has and to achieve some estimated figures with costs and to assess the environmental impacts and all those kind of scenarios on any proposals.

### **The presentation continued**

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And obviously the syndicate puts itself at your disposal should you or anyone in Jersey wish to progress this further or if you require any further assistance.

### **The presentation concluded**

SENATOR VIBERT: Well, I have got quite a few questions.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Yes, okay. Fine.

### **During the question and answer session, both the questions and answers were translated**

SENATOR VIBERT: Yes, could I? It appears to me that we have got three issues. The first is collection, the next is removing all the recyclables and the third is getting rid of what is left. Now, if I could leave aside collection and getting rid of what is left and concentrate on removing all the recyclates. So, at the moment, the Panel have been told by various experts that if we made just one separation in the home, which is the household waste, that is the scrapings from plates, meat, eggs, tea bags, all the stuff from the kitchen, we can actually reduce our waste by at least 30% and that could in fact be composted and turned into compost. So if we were to do that in Jersey, that would leave us with our recyclables, which are the valued items as far as you are concerned. What would be the best way for you to operate that? Would you require a sorting centre here so that the recyclables like plastics ... in other words, if we break that down at the collection point at the household and had glass separated, paper separated, plastics separated and

all that ----

DEPUTY RONDEL: Can Carol translate that bit? She has got a lot to remember.

SENATOR VIBERT: Okay, and glass and plastic.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And then?

DEPUTY RONDEL: Metal.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: Anything that is recyclable.

SENATOR VIBERT: So really all the recyclables and the rest would come to a sorting centre which you would run and you would then sort the remainder, which shouldn't be much, but there possibly will be some. You would then be left with all that categorised, which I take it you could then bale into bales ready for transport to France?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: The recycling centre would refine the sort.

SENATOR VIBERT: It would be the final process.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: It would be the final process because it has to be remembered that each stream of waste then goes off to a specialist area.

SENATOR VIBERT: I understand, but it has to get to France first?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes.

SENATOR VIBERT: I am really talking about in Jersey, what we have to do in Jersey. So the syndicate could run that side of it. In other words, forget the collection for a minute and deal with the sorting of it. Once it has been collected and streamed by the household, it then goes to the final treatment, as it were, which would be run by the syndicate.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, that is right.

SENATOR VIBERT: And, from then on, they would take the responsibility of what they then did with that. It would be their responsibility.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They could do that, no problem. They could take it from collection point and deal with it to end of stream.

SENATOR VIBERT: So they would be responsible for dealing with the shipping of it?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, everything, shipping everything.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Just one second. We are having problems, listening in on the mike. Jean,



can you push your microphone over to Carol a bit and, Ted, when you speak, will you speak into the mike?

SENATOR VIBERT: All right, thank you. Would the syndicate be aware -- I am sure they would be -- that it would be an opportunity for opening up shipping between France and Jersey which could then consolidate an opportunity for a lot of other products to be brought from France to Jersey or the Channel Islands -- let's talk Channel Islands -- from the Channel Islands into France. Would they also be working with that in mind?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They do. They do expect that there will be some development, but obviously their focus is on the export of waste, but they anticipate that there will be additional asides that come out of that. He was just pointing out that the transport of waste has slightly different requirements maybe to the transport back of other materials, but he is sure that he will pick up on those shipping opportunities as they arise.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Senator Le Maistre?

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Yes. Are there examples that you may be aware of where the shipping of waste takes place that one could use as a yardstick for the cost, because there is a concern here that the cost of doing this kind of exercise, separate to what you will do in France, the freight aspect, would be so expensive as to not make it possible?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They do have some very good experience on freight and maritime freight links. They send their scrap metal by freight, by maritime freight. They also send waste to Tunisia by maritime freight and they don't find that the costs are prohibitive. He doesn't believe that the cost would be prohibitive for the transport of waste from Jersey to France. There are opportunities to send some types of waste loose, as he calls it, in the boats and he feels that that would be a very cheap way to transport certain materials. If necessary, and if more economically viable, they would prepare the sorted waste streams and, rather than delivering to a waste recycling plant in France, they would have them delivered directly to the handling place wherever they take that particular waste product. So there are plenty of opportunities to do it in a cost effective way.

SENATOR VIBERT: So in fact the syndicate would decide, for instance, how to ship rubber

tyres.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes.

SENATOR VIBERT: They would decide whether they shredded them and sent them as bulk and that would be entirely their responsibility.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Or bales.

SENATOR VIBERT: Or bales.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes. It would be their responsibility to do that.

SENATOR VIBERT: And the same would apply with plastics.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And they wouldn't anticipate stockpiling materials in Jersey, so they understand that they may well have containerised mixed loads, depending on the waste stream they are dealing with.

SENATOR VIBERT: We have had discussions with Guernsey, who are facing a similar problem to us here, and they have talked to us about whether, if we were to do this with the syndicate, whether you could take their recyclables, which would be shipped here to Jersey, sorted in the same way. In other words, there would be an added value coming into Jersey for you in terms of the amount of recyclables here.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They have ships with containers that take products to China and do several pickups on the way with certain types of plastic and cardboard and what-have-you, so they do have global maritime freight links.

SENATOR VIBERT: Can I just ask about your infill operation -- sorry your landfill operation? Some evidence was given to us about a month ago which was along the lines of to send waste from Jersey into landfill in France would be an environmental abomination. I just wonder whether you think that that statement shows that the person who made it is not really up to date with modern environmental landfill standards.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He is just saying that really there is a political will to accept the waste and to reach the agreements and that really, with all the regulations, if they are adhered to according to the way they are laid out, then there isn't a problem environmentally or anything else.

SENATOR VIBERT: But he pointed out that the people in France who live near landfill sites don't have a great problem with it.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yeah, in the beginning there were concerns by the local residents and that is to be expected. Now it has become a real professional operation with proper technical arrangements and properly trained staff, people accept much more easily this type of operation, once they have actually seen them in operation.

SENATOR VIBERT: We went and saw one, didn't we, with you?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes.

SENATOR VIBERT: That was very, very professionally run.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They opened a new site in 2004, a new in-fill site and so that 2004 site is operating at the highest European levels.

SENATOR VIBERT: Can I just quote this to you? This was from the evidence we were given: *"I am not going to put forward a strategy which effectively is a backwards step in terms of waste strategy than where we are at the moment. Landfill is a backwards step. All countries in the world are going away from landfill. They are going away from landfill to either energy from waste plants or alternative technology, and I have to say they would have to cart me kicking and screaming if I'm going to go down a route of exporting our rubbish and putting it in a hole in the ground."* Would you say that person is up to date?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: In France it is actually a reverse attitude, in that infill is considered the best option for inert waste. In fact, many incinerators in France have closed because they don't meet the European emission standards. Agricultural lobbies do not want incineration plants because of the emission, and especially in the rural areas they are very concerned about the emissions.

SENATOR VIBERT: That is very true in Britain.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: And that is why the syndicate feels and it is generally accepted in France that the landfill approach is actually more environmentally sound than incineration. And the cost is significantly lower and it is manageable.

SENATOR VIBERT: What is the average going to be per tonnage for landfill?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: €60 per tonne approximately.

SENATOR VIBERT: Compared to incineration?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: In Caen is an incinerator and that works out at about €90 per tonne, but they have to now bring the incinerator up to the new European standard, so there is an investment in the infrastructure of the incinerator of €400 million.

SENATOR VIBERT: Is that to update it or build a new one?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: That 400 million is to treat the emissions, to adjust the chimney and the emissions.

SENATOR VIBERT: That is fine. Thank you.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Deputy Rondel?

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: Yes, thank you. Some of the Members of the Panel visited Stavanger in Norway and the communities there were able to divert 75% of their material away from the incinerator, so that means that they only had 25% of their rubbish being sent for incineration. Do you think that your company could achieve such diversion rates with the Jersey rubbish?

SENATOR VIBERT: 40% went to composting, Carol.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: What he is saying is without all the figures and statistics, it is very difficult for them to say, but what he is pointing out is that it is important to understand that, whilst they could achieve that kind of level, you have to look at the cost, because you go to a certain level of recycling and it is still cost effective and, for every one or two per cent beyond that certain point, you are paying significant amounts of money to achieve those few extra per cent, but without statistics and figures it would be very difficult for them to give you any. With vegetable waste they achieve 40% recycling. You need enormous communication to achieve that kind of thing with the public and you have to be prepared to keep working at it in the long term to educate and achieve the changes within the population. In Norway and countries like that they do have a culture for recycling, so they are very respectful of the environment and recycling.

SENATOR VIBERT: Well, we believe the people of Jersey are too, but they have never really been asked to do it.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He is just pointing out that 12 years ago in France, it was considered an imposition -- that you had to do it -- and now in France it is the way of life. It is in business, it is in the home, it is in the schools and so it improves.

SENATOR VIBERT: Sorry, one of the large advantages that we have in Jersey of course is that it is such a small community and it is easy to communicate to 80,000 people.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: He accepts that.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Deputy Duhamel?

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: If indeed the Island of Jersey was to negotiate with your companies to sort out our waste problem, what length of term contract would you be looking for as a minimum?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Twenty-five years because of the set-up of everything that would be required. It is a significant establishment, so 25 years would be the length of the contract they would be seeking. That length of contract would depend on the amount of investment that you would require from the French end. If Jersey did all the sorting and everything built -- the sorting plant -- then obviously the length of contract could be negotiated and it would depend on the level of involvement. But the full involvement would be the longer term contract.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Any other questions, gentlemen? Senator Le Maistre?

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: (asks question in French)

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: The question was how much tonnage did they end up with the landfill site per year and the gentleman answered that it is 150,000 tonnes per year. The capacity is that, but they only received 90 tonnes last year, so they have capacity at the site.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Ninety thousand?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: Yes, 90,000 tonnes, yes, sorry. So they have capacity at the site to take more. And they have authorisation for this site until 2031. And they also use the gases from the site, so it is an energy from waste plant. Yes, it is an energy from waste site even with the landfill.

SENATOR VIBERT: So do you have a company that converts the methane into power?

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: So they collect the methane gas from the landfill site and it is

converted on site by a generator into electricity. They have got micro turbines and all special engines that do that and they sell that electricity on to the French grid.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Any further questions, gentlemen? If not ... (Deputy Rondel congratulated the gentlemen on their presentation and thanked them for coming in French.)

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR: They don't feel that anything is insurmountable.

SENATOR VIBERT: Can I just say that we can get you the statistics that we have so far that have been given to us, which perhaps will help start you off on your thinking.

SCRUTINY TRANSLATOR (translating comment by Senator Le Maistre): It is important to note that the decision for the study will lay with the Environment and Public Services Committee. Yes, the syndicate is very happy to receive any States Members or anyone from Jersey and show them the facilities they have, the recycling they do and give any assistance anywhere that they can.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Thank you. We will now have a break for ten minutes and we will have a coffee.

-----